

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
Lower Level – Room 40, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard
September 11, 2008

Present: Carol Carey, Richard Faricy, Pat Igo, Carole Kralicek, John Manning, Lee Meyer, Mark Shepherd Thomas, Diane Trout-Oertel, Steve Trimble, Shari Taylor Wilsey

Absent: Susan Bartlett Foote, April Haas, Paul Larson

Staff Present: Amy Spong, Christine Barr, Cory Rucker

CALL TO ORDER: 5:05 PM by Manning (Vice-Chair)

1. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA: Agenda was approved as submitted (**Wilsey, Igo**).

2. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

A. July 24, 2008 Public Hearing/Plan Review: The minutes were approved (**Wilsey, Trout-Oertel**).

B. August 14, 2008 Business Meeting: Minutes approved (**Trout-Oertel, Wilsey**)

C. August 28, 2008 Public Hearing/Plan Review: Minutes approved (**Wilsey, Trout-Oertel**)

3. CONFLICT OF INTEREST: None were stated.

4. PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW

A. **1225 Estabrook Drive, Marjorie McNeely (Como Park) Conservatory**, by Lunning Wende Associates, for a preliminary review to construct a 2400 sq. ft. addition to the Como Conservatory along with a terrace, gardens and display benches. (Barr)

Staff read the staff report with preliminary findings. Staff showed photos of the property. Bob Lunning and Bill Klasic were present to discuss the proposal. The goal of the project is to be able to move visitors from the conservatory to the Japanese Garden as well as displaying the bonsai tree collection. There would be an additional building added as well as a walkway to view the addition to the bonsai garden year round. Commissioners had many concerns and questions about the proposed additions. One of the main concerns raised by Commissioner Wilsey was the fact that the addition of the building, landscaping and proposed walkway would interrupt the views that currently exist. The proposed additions of a pavilion and more trees to the landscape would block the main view from anyone entering through the main parking lot.

There were also concerns about the color of the material to be used and how they would correlate with the existing materials and color which are primarily glass structures. Another concern raised by commissioners Manning, Faricy and Meyer was the design and geometry of the new proposed pavilion structure as the design that was proposed would add yet another shape and lead to too many different competing angles. The volume of the proposed addition was also cause for concern amongst the commissioners and the fact that the new additions seemed to be too elaborate and the proposed walk was not elaborate enough. It was noted by the applicant that the balustrade structure in question was not the original design but actually was added on years after original construction.

Applicant seemed receptive to commissioners' ideas and input and noted he would attempt to work closer with recommendations.

B. **435 Portland Avenue, Hill Historic District**, by Kal Construction Inc., for preliminary review to demolish a two-stall garage and construct a two-story addition and attached garage. (Barr)

Staff read the report and presented preliminary findings. The applicant Marshall Smith and Kal Effendi of Kal Construction were present to speak. The property owner Marshall Smith spoke of his intent to preserve the

historical value to the property he owned and add to the character of the neighborhood. He agreed with the staff findings and agreed it would be beneficial to work closely with staff and follow the recommendations put forth by the HPC. The contractor Kal Effendi cleared the concerns Commissioner Wilsey had with the electrical aspect of the proposal in accordance with staff findings.

There were concerns from staff with the final view of the proposed garage and the lack of windows. Applicant agreed that this would be addressed and he would work with staff findings and recommendations throughout the project to completion. Applicant had a future hearing date with the Board of Zoning Appeals to obtain a variance for the proposed additions of a two-stall garage and addition to the second floor of the rear of the house.

5. STAFF UPDATES

A. July Design Review Statistics were included and noted.

Amy spoke briefly of the near completion of the first ever Historic Preservation Plan for the city of Saint Paul. She also updated on a few orders to vacate and their status and noted that there may need to be more involvement in the future to fully utilize the authority and influence of the HPC when necessary to preserve important structures.

B. August Design Review Statistics

6. ADJOURNMENT: 6:55 P.M.

Submitted by: Cory Rucker